

Minutes of the Half Crown-Marsh Neighborhood Conservation District Commission ***Approved at the January 23, 2017 Meeting***

November 21, 2016 - 6:00 PM at Lombardi Building, Basement Conference Room, 831 Massachusetts Avenue, Cambridge

Members present: James Van Sickle, *Chair*; Judith Dortz, *Vice Chair*; William King, Peter Schur, and Charles Smith, *Members*; Adrian Catalano, *Alternate*

Members absent: Marie-Pierre Dillenseger and Deborah Masterson, *Members*

Staff present: Samantha Paull Elliott

Members of the Public: see attached list

Mr. James Van Sickle, Chair, called the meeting to order at 6:00pm and gave an overview of the agenda. Mr. Van Sickle discussed meeting procedures. He noted that as three members were present, Ms. Judith Dortz and Mr. Adrian Catalano would be voting.

HCM-358: 41 Gibson Street, by Anne Duggan and David Raneri. Replace gutters.

Ms. Samantha Elliott, staff, gave an overview of the property, showed slides photos before their renovation project started and current photos.

Ms. Anne Duggan, an owner of 41 Gibson Street, gave an overview of the proposal. She noted that they were seeking approval of an aluminum gutter to replace their non-original wood gutters. She cited their preservation of other key character defining features of the home along with a desire to manage the renovation budget citing a \$5,000 difference. Ms. Duggan said the restoration of the slate roof was rather costly and impacted their budget. She noted that as her gutters had already been partially replaced, the use of a k-style aluminum gutter would have minimal impact on the structure.

Ms. Dortz asked what color they were proposing. Ms. Duggan replied they were currently looking at a color similar to aged copper and that they were not considering bright white. Dr. Peter Schur, Commissioner, asked if the gutters had been installed. Ms. Duggan replied no, but the copper drip edge and skirt was installed as part of the roof repair. Ms. Elliott noted that it would patina. Mr. Adrian Catalano, Commissioner, added that it would patina to a dull brown tone. Mr. William King, Commissioner, noted that color was not within the jurisdiction of the Half Crown-Marsh Neighborhood Conservation District Commission.

Ms. Elliott recommended that the applicant confirm that the metals would not react being in close proximity prior to installation. Ms. Duggan said she would look into it.

Mr. Van Sickle called for public questions – there were none. He called for public comment. There was one email. He read the email from Mr. Ted Wagenknecht of 43 Gibson Street. Mr. Wagenknecht's emailed outlined his concern over the project, his feelings that it was not consistent with the original approval, and his objection to the installation of aluminum gutters. Ms. Elliott noted to the Commission that she

had told Mr. Wagenknecht that she would follow up with the items on the list that were not before the Commission that evening separately. Mr. Van Sickle asked if the skylight was being proposed as Mr. Wagenknecht had accused her of. Ms. Duggan replied no that it was the location of the old chimney and would be enclosed as part of the roof repair, which was still going on at the time of the meeting.

Ms. Duggan noted that they were approved to remove their wood gutters and replace them with an aluminum product last month before the Commission.

Ms. Dortz made a motion to approve the application as submitted. Dr. Schur seconded the motion. Mr. Van Sickle noted that to restore the original profile with a custom aluminum gutter would be an uncommon precedent in the area and the k-style was an acceptable alternative. The motion was approved 5-0.

Minutes

The Commissioners offered edits of the September 19, 2016 minutes and requested an updated copy to reflect the edits.

Dr. Schur made a motion to adjourn the meeting. Mr. Catalano seconded the motion. The motion was approved 5-0 at 6:47 pm.

Respectfully submitted,

Samantha Elliott
Preservation Administrator

**Members of the Public
(who signed the Attendance list)**

Anne Duggan	Owner	41 Gibson Street
David Ranieri	Owner	41 Gibson Street
Max Soiditer	none	[blank]

Note: All addresses are located in Cambridge unless otherwise noted.