

Approved 1/4/10

Minutes of the Mid Cambridge Neighborhood Conservation District Commission

December 7, 2009 - 6:00 P.M. – 831 Massachusetts Avenue, Basement Conference Room

Commission Members: Nancy Goodwin, *Chair*; Carole Perrault, *Member*; Siobhan McMahon, Sue-Ellen Myers, and Monika Pauli, *Alternates*

Staff: Sarah Burks

Members of the Public: See attached sign-in sheet

With a quorum present, Ms. Goodwin called the meeting to order at 6:05 P.M. and made introductions. Ms. Goodwin designated all three alternates to vote on all matters.

Public Hearing: Alterations to Designated Properties

MC-3582: 56 Kirkland St. #6., by Michael L. Charney. To replace windows.

Ms. Burks showed slides and summarized the application for replacement of four windows in one condo unit on the second floor. She noted that the Commission's review was non-binding in this case.

Michael Charney, the condominium unit owner, described the existing 2-over-1 windows in the large window openings and 1-over-1 windows in the narrower openings. He described the proposed Marvin Ultimate Clad Double Hung replacement windows. The exterior would be clad with aluminum in a dark bronze color. The windows would fit within the existing framed openings. The same windows had been approved when the condo association rebuilt the rear wall of the building a few years ago. He described the other units that had replaced windows with the same or similar replacement units.

Ms. Perrault asked about the condition of the existing windows.

Mr. Charney said they were very leaky, some would not operate, and the storms were inaccessible. He said he did not know if they were original windows. The windows in the interior air shaft, which he was currently replacing, were in bad condition and had code issues.

There were no questions or comments from members of the public.

Ms. Perrault expressed the Commission's preference that original or historic wood windows be repaired if possible, rather than replaced. But in light of the fact that many other windows in the building had already been replaced with the same or similar replacement windows, the proposed windows would be easier to find appropriate.

Ms. McMahon moved to approve the application, as presented. Ms. Myers seconded the motion, which passed 5-0.

MC-3583: 58 Dana St., by Daniel Greenbaum. To replace windows.

Ms. Burks showed slides of the building. She explained that the application was subject to non-binding review.

Daniel Greenbaum, the owner, explained that his intent was to restore the existing windows in his unit if feasible, but if not, he would use a full frame replacement. The existing conditions were that the original double hung windows were out of square, leaky, and with a one inch gap in the corners. He said he was considering both the Anderson A-series and Marvin windows. He described the Anderson windows, his first choice. They had either 3/4" or 7/8" wide muntins and the Fibrex

exterior, which is paintable. He was currently getting additional quotes from window repair contractors, as the first quote was very high. The first floor windows would remain in place. He said that none of the other units in his row had their original windows.

Ms. Perrault noted that if repaired and maintained, the old windows might last a lot longer than the new windows.

There were no questions or comments from members of the public.

Ms. McMahon moved to approve the application, as amended by the applicant to include only the replacement of the second floor windows, if repair was not feasible. Ms. Myers seconded the motion. Ms. Perrault offered an amendment to the motion, to add that the Commission expressed its preference that the existing windows be repaired rather than replaced. Ms. McMahon so amended her motion, and Ms. Myers seconded. The motion passed 5-0.

MC-3584: 31 Maple Ave., by Winnie Gray LLC. Restore exterior; replace gutters; replace non-original windows; add new window; install window wells; increase window size in foundation; install skylight; construct roof deck at rear; remove fire escape and replace with new exterior stair at rear; construct new rear stair; replace three windows with doors at rear; restore garage; install HVAC.

Ms. Burks showed slides and described the mansard house of 1887 that had been designed by James Fogerty. The house was a contributing building in the Maple Avenue National Register District. The application was subject to a binding review because of the National Register status.

Jason Korb, manager of Winnie Gray LLC, described his family's history in Cambridge. He introduced architect, Patrick Hayden, with whom he had worked on other historic restorations and tax credit rehabilitation projects. Mr. Korb described the existing conditions of the house, including the asbestos siding, termite and water damage. He said they planned to maintain the three existing units and would apply for both federal and state tax credits. The rehabilitation would also be LEED certified.

Mr. Hayden reviewed the plan and elevation drawings and discussed the proposed alterations and repairs: The slate from the rear side of the roof would be used to patch the slate on the other three sides, then asphalt shingles would be used on the rear side; most brackets could be repaired rather than replaced. New half-round aluminum gutters would be installed; as much of the existing wood clapboards as possible would be preserved; the house would be painted in colors selected in consultation with the Historical Commission staff; most of the existing windows were vinyl replacements; the new windows would be simulated divided light wood double-glazed windows by Jeld-Wen; the fire escape would be removed and a new exterior egress stair constructed on the rear elevation. He explained that additional light for the basement would be achieved by introducing window wells for the new basement windows.

Mr. Korb added that the window wells would also manage water issues and deter rots and termites.

Mr. Hayden described the porch renovations: the existing CMU foundation would be concealed with a dense lattice.

Ms. Perrault asked about the landscape plan.

Mr. Korb answered that the grading of the lot was not changing. A dry well would be installed in the back. A wood fence, similar to the neighbor's fence, would be installed. Condenser units would

be installed in the rear, as far away from the neighbor as possible. The units would be as quiet as possible.

Ms. McMahon asked what changes were proposed for the garages at the rear.

Mr. Hayden said the garages would be retained. The roofing would be replaced, landscaping cut back, and new garage doors installed. The doors would be aluminum in a darker color. The gravel driveway would remain the same.

Ms. Goodwin expressed interest in a site visit to view the conditions beneath the asbestos siding.

Mr. Korb said he would be willing to have a site visit by the Architects Committee.

There were no questions or comments from members of the public.

Ms. Perrault commended the applicants on the thoroughness of their documentation of the house and proposed renovations.

Ms. Goodwin noted that aluminum would not have been the original material for the gutters.

Mr. Korb cited cost as the main factor in choosing aluminum, but assured the commission that ½ round aluminum gutters had been approved by the National Park Service in other tax credit projects.

Ms. Burks noted that a paintable surface could be achieved with aluminum.

Ms. McMahon asked about service wires to the house.

Mr. Korb said the number of lines would be minimized and the appearance cleaned up. He noted that they wanted to put the gas meters on the side of the house, but currently drew them as located on the front, behind shrubs.

Ms. Burks said she could write a letter to the utility company to support the placement on the side of the house. She asked Mr. Korb to forward her the contact information and details.

Ms. Perrault moved to approve the application, as submitted. She further moved that the applicants should keep the staff updated on progress and that the Architects Committee should meet on site to review trim details and a landscape plan, when available. Ms. McMahon seconded the motion, which passed 5-0.

Mr. Korb asked the Commission to write a letter of support for the tax credit application.

Ms. Goodwin authorized the staff to write the letter.

Minutes

Ms. Perrault said she had not been present at the November meeting. Ms. Goodwin said she had no corrections to the minutes. Ms. McMahon moved to approve the November minutes, and Ms. Pauli seconded. The motion passed 5-0.

Ms. Perrault moved to adjourn the meeting. Ms. McMahon seconded, and the motion passed unanimously. The meeting adjourned at 7:10 P.M.

Respectfully submitted,

Sarah L. Burks
Preservation Planner

Members of the Public
Who Signed Attendance Sheet 12/7/09

Jason Korb	18 Whitney St
Michael Charney	56 Kirkland St, #6